Case No. 16-3522

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SEVENTH CIRCUIT

ASHTON WHITAKER, a minor, by his mother and next friend,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

KENOSHA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT NO. 1 BOARD OF EDUCATION and SUE SAVAGLIO-JARVIS, in her official capacity as Superintendent of the Kenosha Unified School District No. 1,

Defendants-Appellants.

Appeal from the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Wisconsin Case No. 16-CV-843 The Honorable Judge Pamela Pepper

AMICI CURIAE BRIEF OF SCHOLARS WHO STUDY THE TRANSGENDER POPULATION IN SUPPORT OF APPELLEE AND AFFIRMANCE

Adam P. Romero
THE WILLIAMS INSTITUTE
UCLA SCHOOL OF LAW
385 Charles E. Young Dr. E.
Los Angeles, CA 90095
310.825.8858
romero@law.ucla.edu

Mark E. Haddad*
David R. Carpenter*
Adriane Peralta
Rahul Hari
SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP
555 West Fifth Street, Suite 4000
Los Angeles, CA 90013
213.896.6679
mhaddad@sidley.com
* applications for admission pending

Attorneys for Amici Curiae Scholars

TABLE OF CONTENTS

				Page
INTE	REST C	F AM	ICI CURIAE	1
BACK	KGROU	ND		2
SUM	MARY	OF TH	E ARGUMENT	9
ARGU	JMENT			10
I.	GENDER IDENTITY DISCRIMINATION IS DISCRIMINATION BASED ON SEX FOR PURPOSES OF TITLE IX			10
II.			DENTITY DISCRIMINATION DEMANDS HEIGHTENED UNDER THE EQUAL PROTECTION CLAUSE	13
	A.		Transgender Population Is An Identifiable, Discrete Minority	14
	B.		gender People Have Long Faced Pervasive Discrimination in domains of Life	
		1.	Discrimination in education, housing, public accommodations, and healthcare	16
		2.	Discrimination in the workplace	17
		3.	Greater Likelihood of Facing Violence and Discriminatory Treatment by Law Enforcement	19
	C.		sgender People Lack the Ability to Eliminate Discrimination agh the Political Process	20
	D.		g Transgender Is Not an Indication of a Person's Ability to ribute to Society	21
CONC	CLUSIC)N		22
APPE	NDIX A	A		23
CERT	TIFICAT	ΓE OF	COMPLIANCE	30
PRAC)F OF S	FRVI	TF.	31

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)
Cases
Adkins v. City of N.Y., 143 F. Supp. 3d 134 (S.D.N.Y. 2015)
Ashlie v. Chester-Upland Sch. Dist., No. 78-4037, 1979 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 12516 (E.D. Pa. May 9, 1979)16
Baskin v. Bogan, 766 F.3d 648 (7th Cir. 2014)1
Bd. of Educ. v. U.S. Dep't of Educ., No. 2:16-CV-524, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 131474 (S.D. Ohio Sept. 26, 2016)
Bellaver v. Quanex Corp., 200 F.3d 485 (7th Cir. 2000)
Bowen v. Gilliard, 483 U.S. 587 (1987)14
Brocksmith v. United States, 99 A.3d 690 (D.C. 2014)15
Brown v. Board of Educ., 347 U.S. 483 (1954)
Campaign for Southern Equality v. Bryant, 64 F. Supp. 3d 906 (S.D. Miss. 2014)
City of Cleburne v. Cleburne Living Ctr., 473 U.S. 432 (1985)
Daly v. Daly, 715 P.2d 56 (Nev. 1986)16
DeBoer v. Snyder, 973 F. Supp. 2d 757 (E.D. Mich. 2014)
Doe v. Brimfield Grade Sch., 552 F. Supp. 2d 816 (C.D. Ill. 2008)
Doe v. City of Belleville, 119 F.3d 563 (7th Cir. 1997)

Doe v. Columbia Univ., 831 F.3d 46 (2d Cir. 2016)1	1
Doe v. McConn, 489 F. Supp. 76 (S.D. Tex. 1980)1	5
Doe v. United Consumer Fin. Servs., No. 01CV111, 2001 WL 34350174 (N.D. Ohio Nov. 9, 2001)1	2
Finkle v. Howard Cnty., Md., 12 F. Supp. 3d 780 (D. Md. 2014)1	1
Frazier v. Fairhaven Sch. Comm., 276 F.3d 52 (1st Cir. 2002)1	1
Glenn v. Brumby, 663 F.3d 1312 (11th Cir. 2011)1	1
Hively v. Ivy Tech Comm'y Coll., 830 F.3d 698 (7th Cir. 2016)	1
Kantaras v. Kantaras, 884 So.2d 155 (Fla. App. 2004)1	6
Kastl v. Maricopa Cnty. Comm. Coll. Dist., No. Civ.02-1531, 2004 WL 2008954 (D. Ariz. June 3, 2004)	1
Lopez v. River Oaks Imaging & Diag. Grp., Inc., 542 F. Supp. 2d 653 (S.D. Tex. 2008)	1
Lyng v. Castillo, 477 U.S. 635 (1986)1	4
Macy v. Holder, Appeal No. 0120120821, 2012 WL 1435995 (E.E.O.C. Apr. 20, 2012)9, 1	1
Michaels v. Akal Sec., Inc., No. 09-cv-1300, 2010 WL 2573988 (D. Colo. June 24, 2010)1	1
Mitchell v. Axcan Scandipharm, Inc., No. VIC.A. 05-243, 2006 WL 456173 (W.D. Pa. Feb. 17, 2006)1	1
Obergefell v. Hodges, 135 S. Ct. 2584 (2015)	0.
Obergefell v. Wymyslo, 962 F. Supp. 2d 968 (S.D. Ohio 2013)2	0.0

6
1
5
6
2
1
1
1
1
1
1
2
0
3
9
5
5

Wisc. Stat. § 111.31-111.395	15
Wisc. Stat. § 939.645	15
Other Authorities	
25 Transgender People Who Influenced American Culture, TIME, May 29, 2014, http://time.com/130734/transgender-celebrities-actors-athletes-in-america/	5
American Psychological Ass'n, Guidelines for Psychological Practice with Transgender and Gender Nonconforming People, 70 Am. PSYCHOL. 832	passim
Anderson, <i>The Christian Church Continues to Spurn Transgender Clergy</i> , VICE, June 25, 2015, https://www.vice.com/en_us/article/the-christian-church-continues-to-spurn-transgender-clergy-456	4
Barry et al., A Bare Desire to Harm: Transgender People and the Equal Protection Clause, 57 B.C. L. Rev. 507 (2016)	3, 15
Berlan, Sexual Orientation and Bullying among Adolescents in the Growing Up Today Study, 46 J. Adolescent Health 366 (2010)	7
Bockting et al., Adult Development and Quality of Life of Transgender and Gender Nonconformity People, 23 Current Opinion in Endocrinology, Diabetes & Obesity 188 (Apr. 2016)	3, 8
Bockting et al., <i>Stigma, Mental Health, and Resilience in an Online Sample of the US Transgender Population</i> , 103 Am. J. of Pub. Health 943 (2013)	6, 7, 8, 12
Bradford et al., Experiences of Transgender-Related Discrimination and Implications for Health: Results from the Virginia Transgender Health Initiative Study, 103 Am. J. Pub. Health 1820 (2013)	16, 17
Brown & Taylor, Bullying, Education and Earnings: Evidence from the National Child Development Study, 27 Economics Educ. Rev. 387 (2008)	7
Carpenter et al., Transgender Status, Employment, and Income (forthcoming 2016)	19
Casey & Reynolds, Standing Out: Transgender and Gender Variant Candidates and Elected Officials Around the World, App. 2 (2015), http://www.lse.ac.uk/InternationalInequalities/pdf/Standing-Out.pdf	20

Clements-Nolle et al., Attempted Suicide Among Transgender Persons:	
The Influence of Gender-Based Discrimination and Victimization, 51	_
J. of Homosexuality 53 (2006)	8
Collier, et al., Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity/Expression Related	
Peer Victimization in Adolescence: A Systematic Review of Associated	
Psychosocial and Health Outcomes, 50 J. SEX RESEARCH 299 (2013)	7
r sychosociai ana Heatin Outcomes, 30 J. SEX RESEARCH 299 (2013)	. /
Conant, I am Nine Years Old: Children Across the World Tell How	
Gender Affects Their Lives, NAT'L GEOGRAPHIC, Jan. 2017	5
Dawson, Transgender, at War and in Love, N.Y. TIMES, June 4, 2015	.4
Flores et al., Williams Institute, Age of Individuals Who Identify as	
Transgender in the United States 4 (2017),	
http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-	
content/uploads/TransAgeReport.pdf	, 4
Flores et al., Williams Institute, How Many Adults Identify as Transgender	
in the United States? (2016), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-	
content/uploads/How-Many-Adults-Identify-as-Transgender-in-the-	
United-States.pdf	4
omed battes.pdf	, 7
Flores et al., Williams Institute, Race and Ethnicity of Adults Who Identify	
as Transgender in the U.S. (2016), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu	
/wp-content/uploads/Race-and-Ethnicity-of-Transgender-Identified-	
Adults-in-the-US.pdf	.4
Flynn, TRANSforming the Debate: Why We Need to Include Transgender	
Rights in the Struggle for Sex and Sexual Orientation Equality, 101	2
COLUM. L. REV. 392 (2001)	3
Gates & Herman, Williams Institute, Transgender Military Service in the	
United States 4 (2014), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-	
content/uploads/Transgender-Military-Service-May-2014.pdf	.4
contour apround, remaining control remaining for the first section of th	• •
GLSEN, School Climate in Wisconsin (2015),	
https://www.glsen.org/sites/default/files/Wisconsin%20State%20Snap	
shot%20-%20NSCS.pdf	7
Grant et al., Nat'l Ctr. for Transgender Equality and Nat'l Gay & Lesbian	
Task Force, Injustice at Every Turn: A Report of the National	
Transgender Discrimination Survey (2011), http://www.thetaskforce.	
org/static_html/downloads/reports/reports/ntds_full.pdf	m
GREYTAK ET AL., GLSEN, HARSH REALITIES: THE EXPERIENCES OF	
TRANSGENDER YOUTH IN OUR NATION'S SCHOOLS (2009)	7

Hendricks & Testa, A Conceptual Framework for Clinical Work with Trangender and Gender Nonconforming Clients: An Adaptation of the Minority Stress Model, 43 PROF. PSYCH.: RESEARCH AND PRACTICE	
460 (2010)	3, 12
Heniz, Rethinking Gender, NAT'L GEOGRAPHIC, Jan. 2017	3, 8
Herman, Gendered Restrooms and Minority Stress, 19 J. Pub. MGMT. & Soc. Pol'y 65 (2013)	13
Herman, LGB within the T: Sexual Orientation in the National Transgender Discrimination Survey, in Trans Studies: Beyond Hetero/Homo Normativities (Martinez San-Migules & Tobias Ed. 2016)	2
Herman, The Williams Institute, <i>Potential Impact of Voter Identification Laws on Transgender Voters in the 2016 General Election</i> (2016), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016-Voter-ID.pdf	21
Inst. of Med., Nat'l Acad. of Sci., The Health of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender People (2011)	2
James et al., Nat'l Ctr. for Transgender Equality, <i>Report of the 2015 U.S. Transgender Survey</i> (2016), http://www.transequality.org/sites/default/files/docs/usts/USTS%20Ful 1%20Report%20-%20FINAL%201.6.17.pdf	essim
Kann, et. al., Sexual Identity, Sex of Sexual Contacts, and Health-Risk Behaviors Among Students in Grades 9–12 — Youth Risk Behavior Surveillance, Selected Sites, United States, 2001–2009, 60 Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report (2011)	7
Keen, <i>An Exclusive Interview With Kim Coco Iwamoto</i> , HAWAII NEWS Now, http://www.hawaiinewsnow.com/story/5676068/an-exclusive-interview-with-kim-coco-iwamoto	5
Kong, Meet the Trans Women of Color Who Helped Put Stonewall on the Map, MIC, June 25, 2016, https://mic.com/articles/121256/meet-marsha-p-johnson-and-sylvia-rivera-transgender-stonewall-veterans#.6mnvQ5Aru	4
Lambda Legal, When Health Care Isn't Caring: Transgender and Gendernonconforming People (2009), https://www.lambdalegal.org/sites/default/files/publications/download s/whcicinserttransgender-and-gender-nonconforming-people.pdf	17

Levi & Redman, The Cross-Dressing Case for Bathroom Equality, 34 SEATTLE L. REV. 133 (2009)	5
Mallory et al., Williams Institute, <i>Harassment by Law Enforcement Officers in the LGBT Community</i> (2015), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/ <i>LGBT</i> -Discrimination-and-Harassment-in-Law-Enforcement-March-2015.pdf	9
Mickens, N.Y. TIMES, http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/projects/storywall/transgender-today/stories/mykel-mickens (last visited Jan. 23, 2017)	.5
Miller, <i>The Trans-Everything CEO</i> , N.Y. MAG., Sept. 7, 2014, http://nymag.com/news/features/martine-rothblatt-transgender-ceo/	4
Nat'l Ctr. for Transgender Equality and Nat'l Gay & Lesbian Task Force, Findings of the National Transgender Discrimination Survey: Wisconsin Results, http://www.transequality.org/sites/default/files/ docs/resources/ntds_state_wi.pdf	7
Nat'l Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs, <i>Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer and HIV-</i> Affected <i>Hate Violence in 2013</i> (2014), http://avp.org/storage/documents/2013_ncavp_hvreport_final.pdf	9
Nuttbrock et al., Psychiatric Impact of Gender-Related Abuse Across the Life Course of Male-to-Female Transgender Persons, 47 J. SEX. RES. 12 (2010)	.8
Office of Mayor Edward B. Murray, <i>Mayor Appoints Director of New Office of Labor Standards</i> , May 29, 2015, http://murray.seattle.gov/mayor-appoints-director-of-new-office-of-labor-standards/	.5
Pizer et al., Evidence of Persistent and Pervasive Workplace Discrimination Against LGBT People, 45 LOYOLA L. REV. 715 (2012)	7
Plaschke, <i>Transgender Teenage Ballplayer as Santa Monica Prep School Spreads Message of Hope and Acceptance</i> , L.A. TIMES, Apr. 10, 2016, http://www.latimes.com/sports/la-sp-transgender-baseball-plaschke-20160410-column.html	8
Rao, Gender Identity Discrimination Is Sex Discrimination: Protecting Transgender Students from Bullying and Harassment Using Title IX, 28 Wis. J.L. Gender & Soc'y 245 (2013)	3
REISNER ET AL., FENWAY HEALTH, DISCRIMINATION AND HEALTH IN MASSACHUSETTS: A STATEWIDE SURVEY OF TRANSGENDER AND GENDER NONCONFORMING ADULTS 16 (2014)	7

Rude, <i>The truth about transgender Republicans</i> , DAILY DOT, Apr. 29, 2015, http://www.dailydot.com/layer8/transgender-republican-bruce-jenner/	5
Sears et al., Williams Institute, Documenting Discrimination on the Basis of Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity in State Employment (2009), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/12_SpecificExamples.pdf;	17
Sears et al., Williams Institute, <i>Relationship of Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity to Performance in the Workplace</i> (2009), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/4_PerformanceInWorkplace.pdf	22
Sears & Mallory, Williams Institute, <i>Documented Evidence of Employment Discrimination and its Effects</i> (2011), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/research/workplace/documented-evidence-of-employment-discrimination-its-effects-on-lgbt-people/	18
Seelman, Transgender Adults' Access to College Bathrooms and Housing and the Relationship to Suicidality, J. HOMOSEXUALITY 1 (2016)	7, 13
Skinner-Thompson & Turner, <i>Title IX's Protections for Transgender Student Athletes</i> , 28 Wis. J.L. Gender & Soc'y 271 (2013)	13
Sontag, <i>Once a Pariah, Now a Judge: The Early Transgender Journey of Phillis Fyre</i> , N.Y. TIMES, Aug. 29, 2015, http://www.nytimes.com/2015/08/30/us/transgender-judge-phyllis-fryes-early-transformative-journey.html?_r=0	5
Srabstein & Piazza, Public Health, Safety and Educational Risks Associated with Bullying Behaviors in American Adolescents, 20 Int. J. Adolescent Med. Health 223 (2008)	6
Stotzer et al., Williams Institute, <i>Transgender Parenting: A Review of Existing Research</i> (2014), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/research/parenting/transgender-parenting-oct-2014;	5
Stotzer, Violence against Transgender People: A Review of United States Data, 14 Aggression and Violent Behavior 170 (2009)	7, 19
Tannehill, <i>The Top 50 successful transgender people you should know</i> , LGBTQ NATION, Jan. 12, 2017, http://www.lgbtqnation.com/2017/01/top-50-successful-transgender-	-
americans-know/	

Pages: 42

Filed: 01/30/2017

INTEREST OF AMICI CURIAE

Amici curiae are sixty-two scholars of demographics, economics, law, psychology, political science, public health, public policy, and other disciplines. Many of them are affiliated with the Williams Institute, an academic research center at the UCLA School of Law dedicated to the study of sexual orientation and gender identity law and policy. Amici have conducted extensive research and authored numerous studies regarding the transgender population in the United States. Individual amici are identified in Appendix A.

As scholars who specialize in issues related to transgender people, *amici* have a substantial interest in this matter. Many of the individual *amici* have testified as expert witnesses in federal district courts and/or have appeared as an amicus in federal Courts of Appeals and the U.S. Supreme Court on related issues. The Supreme Court, this Court, and other federal appellate and district courts have expressly relied on research from the Williams Institute. *See*, *e.g.*, *Obergefell v. Hodges*, 135 S. Ct. 2584, 2600 (2015); *Baskin v. Bogan*, 766 F.3d 648, 663, 668 (7th Cir. 2014); *Campaign for Southern Equality v. Bryant*, 64 F. Supp. 3d 906, 943 n.42 (S.D. Miss. 2014); *DeBoer v. Snyder*, 973 F. Supp. 2d 757, 763-64 (E.D. Mich. 2014). *Amici* believe that the research and data presented herein and *amici's* academic expertise will aid the Court in evaluating why discrimination against transgender students (a) is sex discrimination prohibited under Title IX and (b) requires heightened scrutiny under the Equal Protection Clause of the U.S. Constitution.

This brief is filed with the consent of all parties. Pursuant to Rule 29(a)(4), *amici* state that no one other than *amici*'s counsel authored this brief in whole or in part; no party or party's counsel contributed money intended to fund preparing or submitting this brief; and no person other than *amici curiae*, its members, or its counsel contributed money that was intended to fund preparing or submitting the brief.

BACKGROUND

The term "transgender" generally describes individuals whose gender identity does not correspond with their sex assigned at birth. "Gender identity" refers to a "person's deeply felt, inherent sense" of gender (*e.g.*, being a man, a woman, or genderqueer (*i.e.*, non-binary identity)), while "sex assigned at birth" refers to the assignment made typically at birth by a medical practitioner based on a review of external genitalia. "Transgender" individuals are distinguished from "cisgender" individuals (those whose gender identity matches their sex assigned at birth). One's gender identity typically is established in young toddlerhood and is distinct from sexual orientation; indeed, people who identify as transgender report varying sexual orientations. ⁴

Although evolving, relevant research reflects that sex- and gender-related characteristics are an amalgamation of one's chromosomes, internal and external genitalia, hormones,

_

¹ See, e.g., American Psychological Ass'n ("APA"), Guidelines for Psychological Practice with Transgender and Gender Nonconforming People, 70 AM. PSYCHOL. 832, 832, 862 (Dec. 2015), available at https://www.apa.org/practice/guidelines/transgender.pdf [hereinafter APA Transgender Guidelines]; Hendricks & Testa, A Conceptual Framework for Clinical Work with Trangender and Gender Nonconforming Clients: An Adaptation of the Minority Stress Model, 43 PROF. PSYCH.: RESEARCH AND PRACTICE 460, 461 (2012); Williams Institute, Gender Identity in U.S. Surveillance Group, Best Practices for Asking Questions to Identify Transgender and Other Gender Minority Respondents on Population-Based Surveys ix (2014), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/geniuss-report-sep-2014.pdf [hereinafter Best Practices]; see also James et al., Nat'l Ctr. for Transgender Equality, Report of the 2015 U.S. Transgender Survey 44-45 (2016),

http://www.transequality.org/sites/default/files/docs/usts/USTS%20Full%20Report%20%20FINAL%201.6.17.pdf [hereinafter "USTS"].

² APA Transgender Guidelines, *supra* note 1, at 861-62; *Best Practices*, *supra* note 1, at x.

³ See Inst. of Med., Nat'l Acad. of Sci., The Health of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender People 26-27 (2011); Best Practices, supra note 1, at ix.

⁴ See APA Transgender Guidelines, supra note 1, at 835-36; Herman, LGB within the T: Sexual Orientation in the National Transgender Discrimination Survey, in TRANS STUDIES: BEYOND HETERO/HOMO NORMATIVITIES (Martinez San-Migules & Tobias Ed. 2016); USTS, supra note 1, at 59.

psychology, and cultural associations. In most people, these factors generally align as either "male" or "female." In others, they do not. For example, some people with an XY chromosome do not develop male genitalia, meaning that one's "sex" is not necessarily fixed by one's chromosomes. Likewise, there is ongoing research into potential genetic and biological underpinnings of gender identity, including relating to development of the brain. Contrary to Defendants' assertion, the prevailing understanding of being transgender does not contrast one's "gender identity" to one's "actual 'biological status'" or assume that the sex assigned at birth is one's "actual" sex. *Cf.* Opening Br. 8-9.

According to several *amici*'s analysis of data managed by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, the United States is home to approximately 1.4 million transgender adults, or 0.6% of the U.S. adult population, and 150,000 transgender youth (aged 13-17), or 0.7% of the U.S. youth population.⁸ Transgender people live in every state and other U.S. jurisdictions.

_

⁵ See, e.g., APA Transgender Guidelines, supra note 1, at 861; Heniz, Rethinking Gender, NAT'L GEOGRAPHIC 50, 50-51, 56, Jan. 2017; Best Practices, supra note 1, at ix.

⁶ See, e.g., Barry et al., A Bare Desire to Harm: Transgender People and the Equal Protection Clause, 57 B.C. L. Rev. 507, 515-16 (2016) (reviewing studies); Bockting et al., Adult Development and Quality of Life of Transgender and Gender Nonconformity People, 23 CURRENT OPINION IN ENDOCRINOLOGY, DIABETES & OBESITY 188, 193 (Apr. 2016) [hereinafter Adult Development]; Heniz, supra note 5, at 56.

⁷ Defendants purport to derive the concept of an "actual 'biological status'" from the APA's 2012 guidance for the treatment of gay, lesbian, and bisexual patients. Defendants do not faithfully cite that guidance and in any event ignore the more recent, more relevant definitions in the APA Transgender Guidance and other research specific to transgender issues. *See supra* note 1; *see also* Flynn, *TRANSforming the Debate: Why We Need to Include Transgender Rights in the Struggle for Sex and Sexual Orientation Equality*, 101 COLUM. L. REV. 392, 394 (2001) (collecting studies and noting: "[G]ender identification is generally accepted within the medical and psychological professions as more integral to a person's sex than anatomical birth sex."); Decl. of Dr. Nicholas Gorton, M.D. ¶¶ 16-17, 21, 25.

⁸ Flores et al., Williams Institute, *How Many Adults Identify as Transgender in the United States?* (2016), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/How-Many-Adults-Identify-as-Transgender-in-the-United-States.pdf [hereinafter *How Many Identify*]; Flores et al., Williams Institute, *Age of Individuals Who Identify as Transgender in the United States* 4 (2017),

Wisconsin is home to approximately 19,150 transgender adults and 1,850 transgender youth; in the geographic area of the Seventh Circuit, there are approximately 96,500 transgender adults and 11,000 transgender youth. Nationally and in Wisconsin, younger people are somewhat more likely to identify as transgender than older adults.

Although a small proportion of the U.S. population, transgender people reflect the general population in many respects. They are racially and ethnically diverse; nationally and in Wisconsin, transgender adults are more likely to be a racial/ethnic minority than the general adult population. They are military personnel and veterans, inventors and entrepreneurs, inventors and entrepreneurs, are religious leaders and political organizers, assembly workers and medical professionals, is artists

http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/TransAgeReport.pdf [hereinafter *Age Report*]. *Cf.* Wilson et al., Williams Institute, *Sexual and Gender Minority Youth In Foster Care: Assessing Disproportionality and Disparities in Los Angeles*, at 36-37 (2014), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/LAFYS_report_final-aug-2014.pdf.

⁹ See How Many Identify, supra note 8, at 3-4; Age Report, supra note 8, at 4-5.

¹⁰ Age Report, supra note 8, at 4-5.

¹¹ See Flores et al., Williams Institute, Race and Ethnicity of Adults Who Identify as Transgender in the U.S. (2016), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/Race-and-Ethnicity-of-Transgender-Identified-Adults-in-the-US.pdf.

¹² Gates & Herman, Williams Institute, *Transgender Military Service in the United States* 4 (2014), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/Transgender-Military-Service-May-2014.pdf (estimating that 15,500 transgender individuals are serving on active duty or in the Guard or Reserve forces; approximately 134,300 transgender individuals are veterans or military retirees; and transgender individuals are twice as likely as other adults to have served); *see also* Dawson, *Transgender, at War and in Love*, N.Y. TIMES, June 4, 2015, https://www.nytimes.com/video/opinion/100000003720527/transgender-at-war-and-in-love.html.

¹³ *E.g.*, Miller, *The Trans-Everything CEO*, N.Y. MAG., Sept. 7, 2014, http://nymag.com/news/features/martine-rothblatt-transgender-ceo/.

¹⁴ E.g., Kong, *Meet the Trans Women of Color Who Helped Put Stonewall on the Map*, MIC, June 25, 2016, https://mic.com/articles/121256/meet-marsha-p-johnson-and-sylvia-rivera-transgender-stonewall-veterans#.6mnvQ5Aru; Anderson, *The Christian Church Continues to Spurn Transgender Clergy*, VICE, June 25, 2015, https://www.vice.com/en_us/article/the-christian-church-continues-to-spurn-transgender-clergy-456.

and entertainers, ¹⁶ academics and public servants, ¹⁷ and many other things. ¹⁸ They are U.S. citizens and immigrants. ¹⁹ They span the political spectrum. ²⁰ They have a diverse array of religious and spiritual identities. ²¹ They are parents, and they are people's children. ²²

Despite the many contributions transgender people make to our families, communities, and larger society, "[t]ransgender people face systematic oppression and devaluation as a result

¹⁵ Mickens, N.Y. TIMES, http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/projects/storywall/transgender-today/stories/mykel-mickens (last visited Jan. 23, 2017); Zezima, *Meet Rachel Levine*, *one of the very few transgender public officials in America*, WASH. POST, June 1, 2016, http://wpo.st/Q4nP2.

¹⁶ See, e.g., 25 Transgender People Who Influenced American Culture, TIME, May 29, 2014, http://time.com/130734/transgender-celebrities-actors-athletes-in-america/.

¹⁷ See, e.g., Keen, An Exclusive Interview With Kim Coco Iwamoto, HAWAII NEWS NOW, http://www.hawaiinewsnow.com/story/5676068/an-exclusive-interview-with-kim-coco-iwamoto (last visited Jan. 23, 2017); Office of Mayor Edward B. Murray, Press Release, Mayor Appoints Director of New Office of Labor Standards, May 29, 2015, http://murray.seattle.gov/mayor-appoints-director-of-new-office-of-labor-standards/; Sontag, Once a Pariah, Now a Judge: The Early Transgender Journey of Phillis Fyre, N.Y. TIMES, Aug. 29, 2015, http://www.nytimes.com/2015/08/30/us/transgender-judge-phyllis-fryes-early-transformative-journey.html?_r=0; Teo, Transgender professor advocates for women in science, STANFORD DAILY, Oct. 4, 2013, http://www.stanforddaily.com/2013/10/04/transgender-professor-advocates-for-women-in-science/.

¹⁸ See, e.g., Transgender Lives: Your Stories, N.Y. TIMES, http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/projects/storywall/transgender-today/ (last visited January 30, 2017); Tannehill, *The Top 50 successful transgender people you should know*, LGBTQ NATION, Jan. 12, 2017, http://www.lgbtqnation.com/2017/01/top-50-successful-transgender-americans-know/.

¹⁹ See, e.g., USTS, supra note 1, at 58.

²⁰ See, e.g., Rude, *The truth about transgender Republicans*, DAILY DOT, Apr. 29, 2015, http://www.dailydot.com/layer8/transgender-republican-bruce-jenner/.

²¹ See, e.g., USTS, supra note 1, at 54.

²² See, e.g., Stotzer et al., Williams Institute, *Transgender Parenting: A Review of Existing Research* (2014), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/research/parenting/transgender-parenting-oct-2014; Conant, *I am Nine Years Old: Children Across the World Tell How Gender Affects Their Lives*, NAT'L GEOGRAPHIC, Jan. 2017, at 31-47; Plaschke, *Transgender Teenage Ballplayer as Santa Monica Prep School Spreads Message of Hope and Acceptance*, L.A. TIMES, Apr. 10, 2016, http://www.latimes.com/sports/la-sp-transgender-baseball-plaschke-20160410-column.html.

of social stigma attached to their gender nonconformity."²³ Two large national surveys – the 2011 National Transgender Discrimination Survey (NTDS) and the 2015 U.S. Transgender Survey (USTS) – provide data on the pervasiveness of discrimination and its effects on transgender people's education, future economic prospects, and health.²⁴

According to the recent USTS, 77% of respondents who were out or perceived as transgender in grades K-12 had negative experiences at school from being transgender, such as being verbally harassed or physically or sexually assaulted.²⁵ The NTDS likewise found alarming rates of school-place harassment and assault both nationally²⁶ and specifically among Wisconsin respondents.²⁷ As one USTS respondent recounted:

I was constantly bullied and physically assaulted by my classmates. Teachers would often see it happen and make no move to intervene. The harassment continued, and eventually I had to change high schools three times, each time just as bad as the last, until I finally gave up on public schools.²⁸

Another USTS respondent described abuse so persistent – including being pelted with spit-balls, paper airplanes of hate mail, and soda cans – that the respondent avoided the school bus and restrooms from fear for personal safety.²⁹ Nearly one-sixth of USTS respondents who were out

6

²³ Bockting et al., *Stigma, Mental Health, and Resilience in an Online Sample of the US Transgender Population*, 103 Am. J. of Pub. Health 943, 943 (2013) [hereinafter *Stigma*].

²⁴ See Grant et al., Nat'l Ctr. for Transgender Equality and Nat'l Gay & Lesbian Task Force, Injustice at Every Turn: A Report of the National Transgender Discrimination Survey 32-46 (2011), http://www.thetaskforce.org/static_html/downloads/reports/reports/ntds_full.pdf [hereinafter NTDS]; USTS, supra note 1.

²⁵ USTS, *supra* note 1, at 130-135.

²⁶ NTDS, *supra* note 24, at 3, 33-46.

²⁷ Nat'l Ctr. for Transgender Equality and Nat'l Gay & Lesbian Task Force, *Findings of the National Transgender Discrimination Survey: Wisconsin Results*, at 1 http://www.transequality.org/sites/default/files/docs/resources/ntds_state_wi.pdf [hereinafter Wisconsin NTDS Results]. State-level results from the USTS are not yet available.

²⁸ USTS, *supra* note 1, at 134.

²⁹ *Id*.

as transgender in grades K-12 left school because of harassment; among Wisconsin NTDS respondents, one in five left school.³⁰

These findings are consistent with other research showing that transgender youth face pervasive school-place harassment³¹ and "a high prevalence of sexual assault and rape."³²
Research likewise shows high rates of discrimination and victimization at secondary schools.³³

As these studies reflect, such discrimination and stigmatization impair many transgender students' equal access to education. Because educational attainment, especially high school completion, is a significant determinant of economic status and health across the life course, harassment and discrimination of transgender people at school reduces economic prospects and increases risk of homelessness and other negative outcomes.³⁴

~ .

³⁰ USTS, supra note 1, at 132; Wisconsin NTDS Results, *supra* note 27, at 1; *cf.* Srabstein & Piazza, *Public Health, Safety and Educational Risks Associated with Bullying Behaviors in American Adolescents*, 20 INT. J. ADOLESCENT MED. HEALTH 223 (2008) (documenting drop out rates and other negative effects from bullying).

³¹ See, e.g., Collier, et al., Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity/Expression Related Peer Victimization in Adolescence: A Systematic Review of Associated Psychosocial and Health Outcomes, 50 J. Sex Research 299 (2013); Berlan, Sexual Orientation and Bullying among Adolescents in the Growing Up Today Study, 46 J. Adolescent Health 366 (2010); Kann et al., Sexual Identity, Sex of Sexual Contacts, and Health-Risk Behaviors Among Students in Grades 9–12 — Youth Risk Behavior Surveillance, Selected Sites, United States, 2001–2009, 60 Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report 1, 11 (2011); Greytak et al., GLSEN, Harsh Realities: The Experiences of Transgender Youth in Our Nation's Schools (2009); cf. GLSEN, School Climate in Wisconsin (2015),

https://www.glsen.org/sites/default/files/Wisconsin%20State%20Snapshot%20-%20NSCS.pdf.

³² E.g., Stotzer, Violence against Transgender People: A Review of United States Data, 14 AGGRESSION AND VIOLENT BEHAVIOR 170, 172 (2009).

³³ See, e.g., USTS, supra note 1, at 9, 136; Seelman, Transgender Adults' Access to College Bathrooms and Housing and the Relationship to Suicidality, J. HOMOSEXUALITY 1 (2016) (collecting studies).

³⁴ E.g., USTS, supra note 1, at 137; NTDS, supra note 24, at 32-33, 46; Brown & Taylor, Bullying, Education and Earnings: Evidence from the National Child Development Study, 27 ECONOMICS EDUC. REV. 387 (2008); Stigma, supra note 23, at 943.

Overwhelming research also shows that stigma and mistreatment – not the fact of being transgender – result in transgender individuals experiencing disproportionately high rates of depression, anxiety, and other psychological distress. Fully 82% of transgender people responding to the USTS seriously considered killing themselves at some point in their lives; nearly half (48%) in the previous year. Among respondents who had attempted suicide, more than a third (34%) made their first attempt at age 13 or younger; three-quarters did so before age 18. Other research confirms that transgender people who experience discrimination and gender-related abuse in their youth have higher rates of major depression and suicidality during adolescence.

Research has shown, however, that creating a supportive environment that treats transgender people consistent with their gender identity can ameliorate these negative outcomes. Transgender people who are accepted and supported at home and in their community report lower rates of negative outcomes, including lower rates of mental distress, homelessness, and suicide.³⁹

_

³⁵ See, e.g., Hendricks & Testa, *supra* note 1, at 465 ("Study after study has demonstrated that trans individuals are subject to negative life events directly related to their gender variance and that these events have potentially dire mental health effects"); *Adult Development*, *supra* note 6, at 190; *Stigma*, *supra* note 23, at 948; USTS, *supra* note 1, at 3, 103.

³⁶ USTS, *supra* note 1, at 112-14.

³⁷ *Id.* at 115.

³⁸ See, e.g., NTDS, supra note 24, at 45; Hendricks & Testa, supra note 1, at 465-66; Clements-Nolle et al., Attempted Suicide Among Transgender Persons: The Influence of Gender-Based Discrimination and Victimization, 51 J. OF HOMOSEXUALITY 53, 61-65 (2006); Nuttbrock et al., Psychiatric Impact of Gender-Related Abuse Across the Life Course of Male-to-Female Transgender Persons, 47 J. Sex. Res. 12 (2010).

³⁹ See, e.g., APA Transgender Guidance, supra note 1; USTS, supra note 1, at 76; Stigma, supra note 23; Heniz, supra note 5; Plaschke, supra note 22.

SUMMARY OF THE ARGUMENT

The Supreme Court has long recognized that education is "perhaps the most important function of [the] state," as it provides "the very foundation of good citizenship" and is "a principal instrument in awakening the child to cultural values, in preparing him for later professional training, and in helping him to adjust normally to his environment." *Brown v. Board of Educ.*, 347 U.S. 483, 493 (1954). The lessons children learn at school – about themselves and how to treat others – can "affect their hearts and minds in a way unlikely ever to be undone." *Id.* at 494. A school can teach a student like Ash Whitaker self-confidence and dignity, and help him to become an entrepreneur, scholar, scientist, or civic leader. However, harassment and discrimination against transgender students in schools, including treating them inconsistent with their gender identity, is stigmatizing, causes substantial harm, and impairs their access to equal education. For the reasons set forth in Plaintiff-Appellee's Brief and district court's decision, this Court should conclude that Ash Whitaker has established a sufficient likelihood of success on his claims under both Title IX and the Equal Protection Clause.

1. Research supports Plaintiff's likelihood of success on his statutory claim.

Discriminating against and stigmatizing transgender people based on their gender identity, transgender status, or gender transition are all forms of discrimination based on "sex" within the language of Title IX, as confirmed by *Price Waterhouse v. Hopkins*, 490 U.S. 228 (1989), *Macy v. Holder*, Appeal No. 0120120821, 2012 WL 1435995 (E.E.O.C. Apr. 20, 2012), and related authorities. Moreover, discrimination against transgender students, including with respect to bathroom policies, can deny them the benefits of education, compromise their physical and mental health, and negatively impact their future opportunities – precisely what Title IX is designed to fight against.

2. Research also supports Plaintiff's likelihood of success on his constitutional claim. Plaintiff's Brief explains that Defendants' actions violate the Equal Protection Clause under any level of review. *Amici* write separately to demonstrate that transgender people meet the requirements for suspect-class status. The approximately 1.55 million transgender people (youth and adults) in the United States share characteristics that distinguish them as an identifiable, discrete minority group, and overwhelming evidence demonstrates that transgender people have long been the victims of public and private discrimination permeating all aspects of life.

Moreover, transgender people are a small minority group that lack political power to protect themselves within the political process, and as courts and scholars agree, the discrimination they face bears no relation to their ability to contribute to society. As a result, state action targeting transgender individuals should be subject to heightened scrutiny.

ARGUMENT

I. GENDER IDENTITY DISCRIMINATION IS DISCRIMINATION BASED ON SEX FOR PURPOSES OF TITLE IX

Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972 provides, "No person in the United States shall, on the basis of sex, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance." 20 U.S.C. § 1681 *et seq*. Like the Supreme Court's decision in *Brown*, Title IX reflects that, "because education provides access to jobs and financial security, discrimination here is doubly destructive." 118 Cong. Rec. 5803, 5806-07 (1972) (remarks of Senator Bayh).

As explained in Plaintiff's brief, although Congress enacted Title IX to protect women from discrimination in education, the plain language of the statute extends protection beyond that intention, and the statute clearly protects all people from sex discrimination. *See Oncale v. Sundowner Offshore Servs., Inc.*, 523 U.S. 75, 79 (1998) (explaining that anti-discrimination

statutes "often go beyond the principal evil to cover reasonable comparable evils, and it is ultimately the provisions of our laws rather than the principal concerns of our legislators by which we are governed"); *Doe v. Columbia Univ.*, 831 F.3d 46 (2d Cir. 2016) (holding male student stated Title IX claim); *Frazier v. Fairhaven Sch. Comm.*, 276 F.3d 52, 66 (1st Cir. 2002) (applying *Oncale* to hold that same-sex discrimination is actionable under Title IX). ⁴⁰

The Supreme Court's decision in *Price Waterhouse v. Hopkins*, 490 U.S. 228, 235, 240-42, 258 (1989), and its progeny establish that prohibitions on discrimination on the basis of sex include gender discrimination and discrimination based on nonconformity to stereotypes and norms about sex and gender. *See, e.g., Bellaver v. Quanex Corp.*, 200 F.3d 485, 492-93 (7th Cir. 2000); *Doe v. City of Belleville*, 119 F.3d 563, 580-81 (7th Cir. 1997); *Doe v. Brimfield Grade Sch.*, 552 F. Supp. 2d 816 (C.D. Ill. 2008) (applying *Price Waterhouse* to Title IX). ⁴¹ For this reason, among others, four circuit courts, ⁴² numerous district courts, ⁴³ and the EEOC in *Macy v.*

_

⁴⁰ Courts interpreting Title IX often look to Title VII law, and have held that Title IX prohibits gender stereotyping. *See* U.S. DEP'T OF JUSTICE, CIVIL RIGHTS DIVISION, TITLE XI LEGAL MANUAL § IV.D, https://www.justice.gov/crt/title-ix#I (last visited January 5, 2017).

⁴¹ This Court is currently considering *en banc* whether discrimination based on one's *sexual orientation* is prohibited by Title VII. *See Hively v. Ivy Tech Comm'y Coll.*, 830 F.3d 698, 705-09 (7th Cir. 2016), *pet. for reh'g en banc granted and vacated*, 2016 WL 6768628 (Oct. 11, 2016). A ruling in *Hively* that sexual orientation discrimination is prohibited under Title VII would further support Plaintiff's claims here, but it is not necessary, because being transgender is different from one's sexual orientation. *See supra* note 4.

⁴² Glenn v. Brumby, 663 F.3d 1312, 1316 (11th Cir. 2011); Smith v. City of Salem, 378 F.3d 566, 573 (6th Cir. 2004); Rosa v. Park West Bank & Trust Co., 214 F.3d 213, 215-16 (1st Cir. 2000); Schwenk v. Hartford, 204 F.3d 1187, 1201 (9th Cir. 2000).

⁴³ See, e.g., Finkle v. Howard Cnty., Md., 12 F. Supp. 3d 780 (D. Md. 2014); Rumble v. Fairview Health Servs., No. 14-CV-2037, 2015 WL 1197415 (D. Minn. Mar. 16, 2015); Michaels v. Akal Sec., Inc., No. 09-cv-1300, ZLW-CBS 2010 WL 2573988 (D. Colo. June 24, 2010); Kastl v. Maricopa Cnty. Comm. Coll. Dist., No. Civ.02-1531, 2004 WL 2008954 (D. Ariz. June 3, 2004), aff'd 325 Fed. Appx. 492 (9th Cir. 2009); Schroer v. Billington, 577 F. Supp. 2d 293 (D.D.C. 2008); Lopez v. River Oaks Imaging & Diag. Grp., Inc., 542 F. Supp. 2d 653 (S.D. Tex. 2008); Mitchell v. Axcan Scandipharm, Inc., No. VIC.A. 05-243, 2006 WL 456173 (W.D. Pa. Feb. 17, 2006); Tronetti v. TLC HealthNet Lakeshore Hosp., No. 03-CV-0375, E (SC) 2003 WL

Holder, Appeal No. 0120120821, 2012 WL 1435995, at *10 (E.E.O.C. Apr. 20, 2012), have recognized that sex discrimination encompasses discrimination on the basis of gender identity, transgender status, and/or gender transition. 44

The research described in the Background above confirms this emerging legal consensus. Transgender people face pervasive discrimination based on "their *gender nonconformity*", 45 – i.e., people's "incorrect assumption that gender identity automatically aligns with sex assigned at birth" and that variance is unhealthy or pathological. 46 Just as in *Price Waterhouse* or *City of Belleville* – where the discrimination involved a woman's failure to act more femininely and a man's failure to act more "macho" – discrimination against transgender people frequently manifests when transgender people challenge sex and gender norms by not presenting or acting in conformity with their norms and stereotypes associated with their sex assigned at birth. As a result, transgender people not only face "enacted stigma" (actual experiences of rejection and discrimination), but they may also internalize that stigma, devaluation, and fear of rejection, exacerbating the psychological distress. *See supra* at pp. 7-9; *supra* notes 45-46; *cf. Brown*, 347 U.S. at 494 & n.11 (citing studies on effects of prejudice and discrimination on development).

Not only is discrimination on the basis of gender identity, transgender status, or gender transition discrimination on the basis of sex, research demonstrates that such discrimination is a

22757935 (W.D.N.Y. Sept. 26, 2003); *Doe v. United Consumer Fin. Servs.*, No. 01CV111, 2001 WL 34350174 (N.D. Ohio Nov. 9, 2001).

⁴⁴ *Amici* agree with Plaintiff that *Ulane v. E. Airlines, Inc.*, 742 F.2d 1081 (7th Cir. 1984), has been undermined by *Price Waterhouse* and that this Court should disavow the decision.

⁴⁵ Stigma, supra note 23, at 943 (emphasis added).

⁴⁶ APA Transgender Guidelines, *supra* note 1, at 835, 838, 840; *see also, e.g.*, Hendricks & Testa, *supra* note 1, at 462, 465-66; USTS, *supra* note 1, at 132-134; NTDS, *supra* note 24, at 2-8, 33-39, 50-60 (describing manifestations of discrimination and harassment in school and work settings); *cf.* Levi & Redman, *The Cross-Dressing Case for Bathroom Equality*, 34 SEATTLE L. REV. 133, 151-58, 164-70 (2009) (explaining how bathroom laws targeting transgender people, like anti-cross-dressing laws of old, are rooted in desire to enforce sex and gender norms).

"comparable evil" prohibited by Title IX. As with women at the time Title IX was passed, transgender individuals face "persistent, pernicious discrimination" that serves to "perpetuate second-class citizenship." *Cf.* 118 Cong. Rec. at 5806-07 (Sen. Bayh, discussing purpose of Title IX). Such discrimination and harassment impairs transgender students' equal access to the educational benefits and programs, with discrimination in education compounding discrimination in the workforce, housing, and other areas of life. *See supra* at pp. 7-9. With respect to restroom access specifically, transgender students who are prohibited from using, or experience problems accessing, restrooms consistent with their gender identity report greater absenteeism, poorer performance in school, withdrawing from public spaces and events, physical health impacts (such as bladder infections and kidney problems), and mental health impacts, including increased risk of suicide. All of the foregoing amply establishes Plaintiff's likelihood of success on his statutory claim.

II. GENDER IDENTITY DISCRIMINATION DEMANDS HEIGHTENED SCRUTINY UNDER THE EQUAL PROTECTION CLAUSE

The Equal Protection Clause prohibits governmental classifications that are "arbitrary or irrational" as well as those that reflect "a bare . . . desire to harm a politically unpopular group." *City of Cleburne v. Cleburne Living Ctr.*, 473 U.S. 432, 440, 446-47 (1985). The general rule that classifications need only be "rationally related to a legitimate state interest," "gives way . . . when a statute classifies" groups that have been historically subject to discrimination or

-

⁴⁷ See also, e.g., Rao, Gender Identity Discrimination Is Sex Discrimination: Protecting Transgender Students from Bullying and Harassment Using Title IX, 28 WIS. J.L. GENDER & SOC'Y 245 (2013); Skinner-Thompson & Turner, Title IX's Protections for Transgender Student Athletes, 28 WIS. J.L. GENDER & SOC'Y 271, 296-99 (2013).

⁴⁸ See, e.g., Herman, Gendered Restrooms and Minority Stress, 19 J. Pub. MGMT. & Soc. Pol'y 65 (2013); Seelman, supra note 33 (finding that transgender people who had been denied access to college bathrooms that matched their gender identity were 1.5 times more likely to have attempted suicide than those who were not denied bathroom access, even controlling for other forms of victimization).

"impinge[s] on personal rights protected by the Constitution." *Id.* at 440. Where the law discriminates based on "suspect" classifications, such as race, or "quasi-suspect" classifications, such as gender, it is subject to heightened judicial scrutiny. *Bowen v. Gilliard*, 483 U.S. 587, 602 (1987).

To the extent the Court decides it needs to reach the issue of whether to apply heightened scrutiny, it should hold that transgender people are properly considered a suspect class. Supreme Court jurisprudence identifies various factors in determining whether classifications are suspect, including: whether the class has "obvious, immutable, or distinguishing characteristics that define them as a discrete group;" whether the group has experienced a history of discrimination; whether the group lacks the ability to protect itself within the political process; and whether the discrimination is based on "stereotyped characteristics not truly indicative" of the group's abilities. *Bowen*, 483 U.S. at 602; *City of Cleburne* 473 U.S. at 441-42. All of these considerations show that the Court should review state action that discriminates against transgender people with heightened scrutiny.

A. The Transgender Population Is An Identifiable, Discrete Minority Group

As described above in the Background section, transgender people in the United States are a "discrete" minority group identifiable according to a distinguishing characteristic: a lack of congruence between their gender identity and their assigned sex at birth. *Lyng v. Castillo*, 477 U.S. 635, 638 (1986); *see Adkins v. City of N.Y.*, 143 F. Supp. 3d 134, 139 (S.D.N.Y. 2015) ("transgender status is a sufficiently discernible characteristic to define a discrete minority class"). That "transgender status is a sufficiently discernible characteristic" is also reflected in the fact that transgender people "face backlash in everyday life when their status is discovered." *Adkins*, 143 F. Supp. 3d at 139-40 (citing *Windsor v. United States*, 699 F.3d 169, 181-82 (2d Cir. 2012)).

B. Transgender People Have Long Faced Pervasive Discrimination in All Domains of Life

"[T]here is not much doubt that transgender people have historically been subject to discrimination including in education, employment, housing, and access to healthcare." *Bd. of Educ. v. U.S. Dep't of Educ.*, No. 2:16-CV-524, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 131474, at *58 (S.D. Ohio Sept. 26, 2016); *accord Adkins*, 143 F. Supp. at 139 (stating that "transgender people have suffered a history of persecution and discrimination . . . is not much in debate" (internal quotation omitted)); *Brocksmith v. United States*, 99 A.3d 690, 698 n.8 (D.C. 2014) ("The hostility and discrimination that transgender individuals face in our society today is well-documented.").

For decades, laws have expressly discriminated against transgender people. For example, at local levels, city ordinances long criminalized cross-dressing to enforce gender norms, effectively sweeping transgender people into the criminal justice system. Some legislatures continue to exclude gender identity discrimination from anti-discrimination and hate-crime laws, even while extending protection based on sexual orientation. As recently as last year, North Carolina and Mississippi adopted legislation expressly targeting transgender people.

Transgender individuals have also faced discrimination in the court system, including, for

⁴

⁴⁹ See, e.g., Doe v. McConn, 489 F. Supp. 76, 79 (S.D. Tex. 1980) (involving 53 people arrested under Houston ordinance criminalizing "dress[ing] with the designed intent to disguise his or her true sex as that of the opposite sex"); People v. Archibald, 296 N.Y.S.2d 834, 836 (App. Div. 1968) (affirming conviction of transgender defendant); Levi & Redman, supra note 46 (discussing history of cross-dressing ordinances and case law).

⁵⁰ See, e.g., Wisc. Stat. §§ 111.31-111.395 (employment antidiscrimination law); *id.* § 939.645 (hate crime law); Barry, *supra* note 6.

⁵¹ Public Facilities Privacy & Security Act, N.C. House Bill 2, 2d Extra Sess. (2016) (Sess. Law 2016-3) ("HB2," forbidding transgender people from using single-sex facilities matching their gender identity); 2016 Miss. Laws Ch. 334 (H. B. 1523), § 2(c) (2016) (permitting discrimination on belief that "[m]ale (man)or female (woman) refer to an individual's immutable biological sex as objectively determined by anatomy and genetics at time of birth").

example, denial of parental and familial rights, as well as being cruelly mocked and discriminated against in the context of name-change petitions.⁵²

In addition to de jure discrimination, transgender people face discrimination and stigma in vital areas of life, as explained in the Background and further below, and which is linked to deleterious consequences for health and well-being.

1. Discrimination in education, housing, public accommodations, and healthcare

The Background recounts some of the research showing discrimination against transgender students in education. Discrimination against transgender people in housing and public accommodations is widespread as well. As documented in the USTS and NTDS, for example, many transgender people report being denied a home or apartment or evicted due to their transgender status and an increased likelihood of homelessness.⁵³ Transgender people are frequently denied equal treatment or service and/or verbally harassed at places of public accommodation (*e.g.*, retail stores, hotels and restaurants, doctors' offices, hospitals, etc.).⁵⁴

_

⁵² See, e.g., Daly v. Daly, 715 P.2d 56, 59 (Nev. 1986) (terminating parental rights for seeking to assume a female identity); *Kantaras v. Kantaras*, 884 So.2d 155 (Fla. App. 2004) (reversing custody grant due to parent's transgender status); *Oiler v. Winn-Dixie Louisiana, Inc.*, No. 00-3114, 2002 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 17417, at *28 (E.D. La. Sept. 16, 2002) (asserting that transgender litigant was just "impersonating" a woman and "pretend[ing]" to "disguise himself"); *In re Petition of Richardson to Change Name*, 23 Pa. D. & C.3d 199, 201 (1982) (calling transgender people "gargoyles;" characterizing name-change petition as a "freakish rechristening"); *Ashlie v. Chester-Upland Sch. Dist.*, No. 78-4037, 1979 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 12516, at *14 (E.D. Pa. May 9, 1979) (comparing transgender litigant to man trying to change himself "into a donkey").

⁵³ USTS, *supra* note 1, at 175-78; *see also, e.g.*, Wisconsin NTDS Results, *supra* note 28, at 1; Bradford et al., *Experiences of Transgender-Related Discrimination and Implications for Health: Results from the Virginia Transgender Health Initiative Study*, 103 Am. J. Pub. Health 1820 (2013).

⁵⁴ *Id.* at 214; *see also, e.g.*, Wisconsin NTDS Results, *supra* note 28, at 2; Reisner et al., Fenway Health, Discrimination and Health in Massachusetts: A Statewide Survey of Transgender and Gender Nonconforming Adults 16 (2014); Bradford, *supra* note 53.

Transgender people also face significant hurdles in accessing health care. In the USTS, for example, one in three respondents reported negative experiences in seeking medical care within just the prior year, such as healthcare providers who were unaware of basic aspects of transgender health or who asked invasive questions about the person's transgender status unrelated to his or her reason for visiting.⁵⁵ Nearly one in four USTS respondents reported that they had avoided seeking necessary healthcare from fear of being mistreated.⁵⁶ As one respondent explained:

Multiple medical professionals have misgendered me, denied to me that I was transgender or tried to persuade me that my trans identity was just a misdiagnosis of something else, have made jokes at my expense in front of me and behind my back, and have made me feel physically unsafe. I often do not seek medical attention when it is needed, because I'm afraid of what harassment or discrimination I may experience in a hospital or clinic.⁵⁷

2. Discrimination in the workplace

Overwhelming evidence documents pervasive discrimination against transgender people in the workplace. ⁵⁸ For example, among USTS respondents, 27% of those who held or applied for a job reported being fired, denied a promotion, or not hired because of their gender identity or

^{5.}

⁵⁵ USTS, *supra* note 1, at 97; *see also*, *e.g.*, Wisconsin NTDS Results, *supra* note 28, at 2; REISNER, *supra* note 54, at 20; Lambda Legal, *When Health Care Isn't Caring: Transgender and Gendernonconforming People* (2009),

https://www.lambdalegal.org/sites/default/files/publications/downloads/whcicinserttransgender-and-gender-nonconforming-people.pdf.

⁵⁶ USTS, *supra* note 1, at 98.

⁵⁷ *Id.* at 96.

⁵⁸ See, e.g., Pizer et al., Evidence of Persistent and Pervasive Workplace Discrimination Against LGBT People, 45 LOYOLA L. REV. 715 (2012); Sears et al., Williams Institute, Documenting Discrimination on the Basis of Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity in State Employment (2009), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/12_SpecificExamples.pdf; Bradford, supra note 53; NTDS, supra note 24, at 50-70; Wisconsin NTDS Results, supra note 27, at 1.

expression *in just the prior year*, while 15% reported being verbally harassed, physically attacked, or sexually assaulted.⁵⁹

Transgender people also face high unemployment rates. Fifteen percent of USTS respondents reported being unemployed, more than triple the national unemployment rate at the time of the survey. ⁶⁰ Unemployment rates were even higher for transgender people of color: 35% of Middle Eastern respondents, 20% of Black respondents, and 21% of Latino respondents were unemployed. ⁶¹

Connected to discrimination, unemployment, or under-employment, many transgender people are living in poverty. Twelve percent of USTS respondents reported earning less than \$10,000 annually – a rate three times that of the U.S. population at the time of the survey. Even those USTS respondents with income above \$10,000 per year reported lower household incomes than the general population: 62% had household incomes under \$50,000 per year (compared to 38% of the general population), while only 15% reported earning more than \$100,000 per year (compared to 31% of the general population). Nearly one third (29%) of respondents were living in poverty compared to the 14% national average.

These figures are consistent with a forthcoming study by several *amici*, based on representative data from 27 states, finding "clear evidence that self-identified transgender

18

⁵⁹ USTS, *supra* note 1, at 148, 150-53.

⁶⁰ *Id.* at 140; *see also* Sears & Mallory, Williams Institute, *Documented Evidence of Employment Discrimination and its Effects* (2011), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/research/workplace/documented-evidence-of-employment-discrimination-its-effects-on-lgbt-people/.

⁶¹ USTS, supra note 1, at 141.

⁶² *Id.* at 142.

⁶³ *Id.* at 144.

⁶⁴ *Id*..

individuals have significantly lower employment rates and household incomes and significantly higher poverty rates than non-transgender individuals."⁶⁵ The study concludes that transgender adults suffer a "household income penalty" equivalent to 12% of annual household income. ⁶⁶

3. Greater Likelihood of Facing Violence and Discriminatory Treatment by Law Enforcement

Transgender people face high levels of physical violence. In 2013 alone, the National Council of Anti-Violence Programs reported 13 hate-motivated murders of transgender women. In its 2009 report in support of Local Law Enforcement Hate Crimes Prevention Act of 2009, Congress recognized that over 400 people were murdered due to anti-transgender bias in the preceding decade, including 21 in 2008 alone. As explained in the Background, transgender individuals suffer high rates of sexual violence, yet they rarely report the crimes, often from fear of mistreatment by the police and others.

Indeed, respondents to the USTS reported high levels of harassment, abuse, or neglect by law enforcement officers. Of respondents who had interacted with law enforcement officers in the year before the survey, well over half (58%) reported negative treatment, 20% reported verbal harassment or disrespect, and 4% reported being physically attacked by officers. ⁷⁰ In

⁶⁵ Carpenter et al., *Transgender Status*, *Employment*, *and Income* (forthcoming 2016), at 9 (on file with counsel).

⁶⁶ *Id*.

⁶⁷ Nat'l Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs, *Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer and HIV*-Affected *Hate Violence in 2013*, at 8, 22–23 (2014), http://avp.org/storage/documents/2013_ncavp_hvreport_final.pdf.

⁶⁸ H.R. Rep. No. 111-86, at 11 (2009).

⁶⁹ Stotzer, *supra* note 32, at 172-73.

⁷⁰ USTS, *supra* note 1, at 186; *see also* Mallory et al., Williams Institute, *Harassment by Law Enforcement Officers in the LGBT Community* (2015), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/*LGBT*-Discrimination-and-Harassment-in-Law-Enforcement-March-2015.pdf.

some cases, police officers were unwilling to assist transgender people who had been the victim of crimes. One respondent described her encounter with law enforcement:

I was found in a ditch after being brutally raped for three days. I was taken to an ER. There I met an officer who told me I deserved it for attempting to be a woman and should have died. He also refused to take a report.⁷¹

Fifty-seven percent of respondents admitted being uncomfortable approaching the police for assistance.⁷²

C. Transgender People Lack the Ability to Eliminate Discrimination Through the Political Process

As a minority comprising just 0.6% of the total adult population, transgender people lack political power to protect themselves in the political process against a hostile majority. *Bd. of Educ.*, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 131474, at *59-60 (finding transgender community politically powerless "as a tiny minority of the population, whose members are stigmatized for their gender non-conformity in a variety of settings"); *see also Obergefell v. Wymyslo*, 962 F. Supp. 2d 968, 989-90 (S.D. Ohio 2013) (citing "small population size" as factor establishing powerlessness of gays and lesbians), *rev'd DeBoer v. Snyder*, 772 F.3d 388 (6th Cir. 2014), *rev'd Obergefell v. Hodges*, 135 S. Ct. 2584 (2015).

Further evidence that transgender people lack political power is reflected by the lack of openly transgender elected or appointed political officials. In *Adkins*, the court recognized the absence of openly transgender members of the United States Congress or federal judiciary. 143

_

⁷¹ USTS, *supra* note 1, at 201.

⁷² *Id.* at 185.

F. Supp. 3d at 140. A recent study found only three openly transgender elected officials, all at local levels, and that very few transgender people have ever even been candidates.⁷³

Although there are no conclusive answers as to why transgender individuals are underrepresented in elected and appointed office, research suggests that an enormous hurdle is getting transgender candidates—who may have to overcome fears of violence, discrimination, or backlash—to run. Transgender individuals also may lack the support needed to get elected if political parties and influential donors do not believe transgender candidates can win elections or are otherwise reluctant to give their support to transgender candidates.

Transgender people's political power is also undermined by laws requiring voters to have a certain form of identification in order to vote. These laws risk disenfranchising many transgender individuals, who face administrative obstacles to obtaining identification that reflects their correct gender identity. According to one recent study, the strictest of these voter-identification laws may have disenfranchised over 34,000 transgender people in eight states in the November 2016 general election.⁷⁵

D. Being Transgender Is Not an Indication of a Person's Ability to Contribute to Society

The final factor in determining whether a classification demands heightened scrutiny is whether the group in question is distinctively different from other groups in a way that "bears [a]

-

⁷³ See Casey & Reynolds, Standing Out: Transgender and Gender Variant Candidates and Elected Officials Around the World, App. 2 (2015), http://www.lse.ac.uk/InternationalInequalities/pdf/Standing-Out.pdf.

⁷⁴ *Id.* at 19-21.

⁷⁵ Herman, The Williams Institute, *Potential Impact of Voter Identification Laws on Transgender Voters in the 2016 General Election* (2016), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016-Voter-ID.pdf.

relation to ability to perform or contribute to society." *City of Cleburne*, 472 U.S. at 440-41 (quotation omitted). Being transgender does not.

As explained in the Background, transgender people contribute to the workplace and our society in countless ways unrelated to their gender identity, including as CEOs, soldiers, scholars, health care workers, and parents, among others. As *Adkins* recently explained:

Some transgender people experience debilitating dysphoria while living as the gender they were assigned at birth, but this is the product of a long history of persecution forcing transgender people to live as those who they are not. The Court is not aware of any data or argument suggesting that a transgender person, simply by virtue of transgender status, is any less productive than any other member of society.

143 F. Supp. 3d at 139; see also Bd. of Educ., 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 131474, at *59.

Given the opportunity to be who they are, transgender individuals can thrive. Yet the research also shows that discrimination and stigma threatens transgender kids' education, economic prospects, health, and well-being. Schools should support and protect their students, rather than perpetuate discrimination and its effects.

CONCLUSION

For these reasons and those in Plaintiff-Appellee's brief, the District Court's orders should be affirmed.

Dated: January 30, 2017 Respectfully submitted,

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP

By: /s/ Mark E. Haddad
Mark E. Haddad
Attorneys for Amici Curiae Scholars

⁷⁶ See supra notes 12-22; Sears et al., Williams Institute, *Relationship of Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity to Performance in the Workplace* (2009), http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/4 PerformanceInWorkplace.pdf.

<u>APPENDIX A – LIST OF INDIVIDUAL AMICI</u>

Institutions are provided for identification purposes only

Katherine R. Allen Professor of Human Development Virginia Tech

Nadav Antebi-Gruszka
Postdoctoral Researcher
The Center for HIV Educational Studies & Training (CHEST)
Hunter College
City University of New York
Mental Health Counseling, Department of Psychology
City College
City University of New York

M. V. Lee Badgett Professor of Economics University of Massachusetts Amherst Williams Distinguished Scholar Williams Institute UCLA School of Law

Carlos A. Ball Distinguished Professor of Law Rutgers University

Juan Battle Professor of Sociology, Public Health, & Urban Education City University of New York Graduate Center

John R. Blosnich Adjunct Assistant Professor Department of Behavioral and Community Health Sciences Graduate School of Public Health University of Pittsburgh

H.M.W. (Henny) Bos Assistant Professor of Childhood Education and Family Support University of Amsterdam

Michael Boucai Associate Professor SUNY Buffalo Law School

William Byne Associate Professor, Psychiatry Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai

Devon W. Carbado The Honorable Harry Pregerson Professor of Law UCLA School of Law

Christopher S. Carpenter Professor, Department of Economics Vanderbilt University

Kate L. Collier Independent Scholar

Kerith Conron Blachford-Cooper Distinguished Scholar and Research Director Williams Institute UCLA School of Law

Paisley Currah Professor of Political Science and Women's and Gender Studies The Graduate Center and Brooklyn College City University of New York

Daniela G. Domínguez Daniela Dominguez Assistant Professor University of San Francisco

Katie Eyer Associate Professor Rutgers Law School

Rachel H. Farr Assistant Professor Department of Psychology University of Kentucky

Adam W. Fingerhut Associate Professor Department of Psychology Loyola Marymount University

Andrew R. Flores Assistant Professor, Department of Government Mills College

Nanette Gartrell Visiting Distinguished Scholar Williams Institute UCLA School of Law Guest Appointment, University of Amsterdam

Gary J. Gates Senior Researcher, Gallup Distinguished Scholar (retired) Williams Institute UCLA School of Law

Jeremy T. Goldbach Assistant Professor University of Southern California Suzanne Dworak-Peck School of Social Work

Abbie E. Goldberg Associate Professor & Director of Clinical Training Department of Psychology Clark University

Gilbert Gonzales Assistant Professor Department of Health Policy Vanderbilt University School of Medicine

Allegra R. Gordon Fellow, Division of Adolescent Health Boston Children's Hospital and Harvard Medical School

Amira Hasenbush Jim Kepner Law and Policy Fellow Williams Institute UCLA School of Law

Jody L. Herman Williams Scholar of Public Policy Williams Institute UCLA School of Law

Ian W. Holloway Assistant Professor UCLA Luskin School of Public Affairs

Ning Hsieh Assistant Professor Department of Sociology Michigan State University

David M. Huebner Associate Professor Department of Prevention and Community Health Milken Institute School of Public Health George Washington University

Nan D. Hunter Professor of Law Georgetown University Law Center Visiting Distinguished Scholar The Williams Institute UCLA School of Law

Courtney G. Joslin Professor of Law and Martin Luther King Jr. Hall Research Scholar UC Davis School of Law, King Hall

Laura T. Kessler Professor of Law S.J. Quinney College of Law University of Utah

Suzanne A. Kim Professor of Law Rutgers Law School

Nancy J. Knauer I. Herman Stern Professor of Law & Director of Law and Public Policy Programs Beasley School of Law Temple University

Jasleen Kohli Director, Critical Race Studies Program UCLA School of Law

Zachary Kramer Professor of Law Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law Arizona State University

Sylvia Law Elizabeth K. Dillard Professor of Law, Medicine & Psychiatry NYU Law School

Arthur S. Leonard Professor of Law New York Law School

Greg Lewis

Professor and Department Chair of Public Management and Policy Andrew Young School of Policy Studies Georgia State University

Christy Mallory Senior Counsel and Anna M. Curren Fellow Williams Institute UCLA School of Law

Ilan H. Meyer Williams Distinguished Scholar of Public Policy Williams Institute UCLA School of Law

John Pachankis Associate Professor Yale School of Public Health

Kim Hai Pearson Associate Professor of Law Gonzaga University School of Law

Nancy Polikoff Professor of Law American University Washington College of Law

Andrew Reynolds Professor, Department of Political Science Director, UNC LGBTQ Representation and Rights Research Initiative UNC Chapel Hill

Ellen D.B. Riggle Professor, Department of Political Science University of Kentucky

Darren Rosenblum Professor of Law Pace Law School

Clifford Rosky Professor of Law S.J. Quinney College of Law University of Utah

Esther D. Rothblum Professor of Women's Studies San Diego State University

Stephen T. Russell Priscilla Pond Flawn Regents Professor in Child Development Department of Human Development and Family Sciences University of Texas at Austin

Sheree M. Schrager Director of Research, Division of Hospital Medicine Children's Hospital Los Angeles

R. Bradley Sears
Roberta A. Conroy Scholar of Law and Policy and Executive Director
The Williams Institute
Adjunct Professor of Law and Assistant Dean
UCLA School of Law

Kristie L. Seelman Assistant Professor School of Social Work Georgia State University

Randall Sell Associate Professor Dornsife School of Public Health Drexel University

Scott Skinner-Thompson Acting Assistant Professor New York University School of Law

Catherine Smith Professor of Law University of Denver Sturm College of Law

Edward Stein Professor of Law Director, Gertrud Mainzer Program in Family Law, Policy, & Bioethics Cardozo School of Law Yeshiva University

Rylan Jay Testa Assistant Professor Department of Psychology Rhodes College

Ari Ezra Waldman Associate Professor of Law New York Law School

Bianca D.M. Wilson Rabbi Barbara Zacky Senior Scholar of Public Policy Williams Institute UCLA School of Law

Jordan Blair Woods Assistant Professor of Law University of Arkansas School of Law

CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

1. This brief complies with the type-volume limitation of Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 29(d) and Circuit Rule 29, because it contains 6,998 words, excluding the parts of the brief exempted by Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 32(a)(7)(B)(iii).

2. This brief complies with the typeface requirements of Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 32(a)(5) and Circuit Rule 32, and the type-style requirements of Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 32(a)(6), because it has been prepared in a proportionally spaced typeface using Microsoft Word in 12-point Times New Roman font.

By: /s/ Mark E. Haddad

Mark E. Haddad

Attorneys for Amici Curiae Scholars

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 30, 2017, I caused the foregoing AMICI CURIAE BRIEF OF SCHOLARS WHO STUDY THE TRANSGENDER POPULATION IN SUPPORT OF APPELLEE AND AFFIRMANCE to be filed electronically with the Clerk of the Court for the United States Court of Appeals for the Seventh Circuit by using the CM/ECF system. I certify that all participants in the case are registered CM/ECF users and that service will be accomplished by the CM/ECF system.

By: /s/ Mark E. Haddad

Mark E. Haddad

Attorneys for Amici Curiae Scholars